

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level – Room 40, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard
January 8, 2009

Present: Mark Thomas, Steve Trimble, Pat Igo, Carole Kralicek, John Manning, Shari Taylor Wilsey, Lee Meyer, Paul Larson, Carol Carey

Absent: Richard Faricy (excused), April Haas (excused), Diane Trout-Oertel (excused), Susan Bartlett Foote (excused)

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware, Cory Rucker

BUSINESS MEETING

5:10

I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA- Approved as submitted. 7-0 (Wilsey, Thomas)

II. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES- Approved as submitted. 7-0 (Thomas, Wilsey)

A. December 18, 2008 Permit Review/Public Hearing

III. PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

A. **1225 Estabrook Drive, Marjorie McNeely (Como Park) Conservatory**, by Lunning Wende Associates, for a second preliminary review to construct an addition to the Como Conservatory along with a terrace, gardens and display benches. (Boulware, 266-9067)

Staff read the report with preliminary findings. Staff showed photos of the site and planned designs. The architect Robert Lunning addressed some of the concerns staff had in its findings. He addressed issues of the color and tone of the glass that would be added with the new addition and answered concerns about the angles of the proposed building and the difference in the geometry of the building. Bill Pesek from Parks and Recreation was on hand to address the issue of the leveling off of the landscape to avoid the buckling of walls in the proposed new addition area surrounding the conservatory. Commissioners Wilsey and Kralicek questioned the placement of plants around the building and felt it would impede and take away from the existing view and site lines of the conservatory.

Frank Fitzgerald spoke on behalf of the applicant and showed pictures and proposed designs of the trees and planting that would be added. He gave in depth detail of the proposed fence that would secure the new additions and offered some insight into how it would blend in with the current surroundings. There was some concern that the addition of the proposed terrace would diminish the historical view of the conservatory. Fitzgerald spoke of scaling down the size of the plantings that would make for a clear view of the conservatory.

Bonsai Planters at the north end of the terrace were not addressed in the preliminary findings, as they were not indicated on the drawings that were submitted with the application. Several members of the commission expressed concern about the size, location, shape and material of the monolithic type structures. It was indicated that they would be approximately 7-9 feet in height and 3-4 feet wide.

There were still some issues and questions in regards to the exact materials and colors that would be used since they were not submitted at the time of this meeting. Items such as what plant would be planted to follow the fence line and the color of the material to be used in the new additions. The wrapping of the balustraded walkout at the north end of the north wing was discussed along with the placement of the

terrace and how it could be shifted to expose more of the balustrade and pushed back toward the addition and service road several feet to have a lesser impact on the view from an to the conservatory.

It was noted that the applicant is looking more at the design and construction as it relates to the Japanese Garden; where as the commission's role is to review the project and its impact on the conservatory and its immediate site.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

- A. Saint Paul City Hall/Ramsey County Courthouse, Individual Heritage Preservation Site, adopt resolution regarding the security/screening alterations proposed for Memorial Hall and the Kellogg Boulevard entrance. Three HPC members (Trout-Oertel, Larson, and Wilsey) will meet with planning committee for the remodel of Memorial Hall and offer advice and guidance on the design and impact to the space.
- B. 3M update: With all of the attention the old 3m site has garnished, a few commission members will participate in discussion and attend meetings to report back to the HPC. The goal is to play a key role in the redevelopment decision process and add thoughtful insight where needed in regards to historical significance and preservation guidelines.

V. DISCUSSION ITEM

- A. **437 Mount Ida Street**, Historic Resource Review to advise City Council. The property has orders to remove or repair. The Legislative Hearing Officer continued the item to the January 13 Legislative Hearing with a City Council hearing date on January 23. RA-SPC-4715 (Boulware, 266-9067)

There was no vote on this item, as the residence was demolished by the owner prior to the meeting. There was some discussion about the architecture and context of the potential Mount Ida Street Historic District.

VI. ANNUAL MEETING

- A. Election of officers for 2009 (Nomination committee: Kralicek, Thomas and Trout-Oertel)
Commissioner Manning was elected President. Commissioner Igo was elected Vice President.
Commissioner Trout-Oertel was elected Secretary. (7-0) Unanimous.
- B. Draft annual permit statistics.

VII. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. December Design Review Statistics (submitted in packet)

VIII. ADJOURN 7:35

Submitted by: Cory Rucker